

CR #	Concern Text	Letter #	Comment #	Comment Text	Response Text
2	There is a concern that the Forest Service will allow for logging of trees that shouldn't be removed, especially green trees and large trees, and that this will result in desertification in the long term and the loss of a natural seed source.	1651	65	Unit 518- Section 5, on the south facing ridge of the southwest plantation along road 46N64. <b>Comment:</b> The stand is a plantation of ponderosa pine with a few small grouping of larger trees. Structure is uniform, mortality pretty high. Please retain large tree component.	Effects of logging on natural seed sources, and large and green trees, are addressed in the draft Environmental Impact Statement (DEIS).
3	There is a concern that salvage logging in burned areas will inhibit natural growth and recovery of plants and will negatively impact fragile post-fire soils.	1651 1698	61 78	Unit 511: north-east of Lake Mountain Lookout adjacent to large meadow/wetland system at the headwaters of Kuntz Creek. <b>Comment:</b> Unit 511 consists of mostly mountain hemlock with some true firs, western white pine, and an understory of green leaf manzanita. The stand burned in a highly variable mixed severity fire mosaic, leaving a diverse, mixed age stand. Many live green trees are scattered throughout the unit and the thin bark of mountain hemlock that survived the fire could easily be damaged during logging and yarding operations. Some, if not all the unit appears to be "ground based" yarding, meaning soils, post-fire regeneration and residual trees will sustain substantial damage. The variability of the stand prior to the Happy Camp Fire indicates that the stand has been influenced historically by mixed severity fire. Likewise, the presence of green leaf manzanita in the understory and the age class diversity of the stand indicate that fire or some other disturbance process has, in the past, influenced the development of the stand in unit 511. The fire severity and associated mortality levels in unit 511 were highly variable, but mainly low to moderate in the Happy Camp Fire, creating a very characteristic fire mosaic. According to widely understood stand development patterns in mountain hemlock dominated stands, the fire effects sustained in the Happy Camp Fire were beneficial, in that they helped to maintain habitat conditions and stand structure in a way that will maintain conifer dominance, encourage age class diversity, while reducing fuels and creating highly heterogeneous stand conditions. The fire regime of mountain hemlock is one of long fire return intervals and moderate to high severity effects. Mountain hemlock communities have been relatively minimally impacted by fire suppression due to these long fire return intervals (Agee 1993, p.278). Thus, the stand structure and composition have not been significantly altered allowing for natural fire effects. This is not a stand in need of restoration, nor is it a plant community that has suffered from fire suppression. Unit 511 also extends below road 45N65 into the meadow/wetland system at the headwaters of Kuntz Creek. Salvage is proposed in a large fire killed stand of red fir adjacent to and interspersed with wetlands and meadows. The impact to wetland habitats from salvage operations would be great. Likewise, the snag patch adjacent to the meadow provides beneficial wildlife and bird habitat and should be retained. Much like the mountain hemlock red fir plant communities are adapted to long fire return intervals and moderate to high severity effects. The fire effects sustained in the Happy Camp Fire were well within the range of variability and help to maintain diverse structural and compositional conditions. No salvage logging or replanting should be allowed in this currently fire-adapted plant community. (Cannot insert photo here - see attached) Low to moderate severity fire in mountain hemlock forest on the north slope of Lake Mountain in unit 511. The unit burned in a healthy mosaic, including a limited amount of mortality. The unit does not constitute uncharacteristic or unhealthy fire effects and should be dropped from consideration in the Westside Project	Effects of logging on natural growth and recovery of plants, and post-fire soils, are addressed in the DEIS.
3	There is a concern that salvage logging in burned areas will inhibit natural growth and recovery of plants and will negatively impact fragile post-fire soils.	1651 1698 1697 1651	63 19 90 71	Exclude these areas from mechanical treatment: "Inventoried and Released Roadless Areas, including the Grider, Tom Martin, Russian, Snoozer, Kelsey, or Johnson Roadless Areas. "Grider and Russian Creek drainages. "Endemic or rare conifer stands and adjacent available habitat. This would include foxtail pine (Pinus balfouriana), Baker's cypress (Cupressus bakeri), and Brewer spruce (Picea breweriana) to allow for natural regeneration.	Effects of logging on natural growth and recovery of plants, and post-fire soils, are addressed in the DEIS.
3	There is a concern that salvage logging in burned areas will inhibit natural growth and recovery of plants and will negatively impact fragile post-fire soils.	1651 1698	60 67	Unit 512 - east-southeast of Lake Mountain Lookout and Botanical Area. <b>Comment:</b> Unit 512 consists of a large, old stand of true fir, much of the stand was fire killed in the Happy Camp Fire, but live trees remain scattered throughout the unit. The stand is bordered by sub-alpine rock gardens and adjacent to the Lake Mountain Botanical Area where the northern-most stand of foxtail pine (Pinus balfouriana) is located. The isolated stand of fire killed fir lies adjacent to nearly fire impermeable rock gardens that support the grove of foxtail pine. These habitats, for the most part, did not burn in the Happy Camp Fire despite being entirely surrounded by wildfire. The existing foxtail pine stand and the adjacent fire lookout sustained no damage from the Happy Camp Fire whatsoever. In fact, the fire could have enhanced habitat conditions for foxtail pine. The open, south facing location of unit 512, the adjacent ridgeline habitat, and the post fire condition could allow for expansion of foxtail pine habitat on Lake Mountain. The adjacent high-elevation fire killed, snag field could provide the necessary microclimate and habitat conditions for foxtail pine regeneration. The snags would theoretically provide perching habitat and as the fall cache habitat for Clark's nutcrackers, the primary dispersal agent for foxtail pine. The Lower Scott Ecosystem Analysis states that "the health of the stand appears low,"*and that little regeneration of foxtail pine exists in the botanical area, with more regeneration found to the north and east outside the designated botanical area (Lower Scott River EA 2000, p.3-44). Unit 512 is due east of the botanical area. Recent fire conditions, including stand replacing patches, will encourage regeneration of foxtail pine by creating sunny pockets and bare mineral soil. The natural recovery of this stand could provide an ideal study site for the KNF to monitor foxtail pine regeneration and wildfire. It is highly likely that the more open post fire condition will provide an increase in available foxtail pine habitat. Such a monitoring project would be much more in line with a "fire recovery" project than salvage logging, especially given the adjacent botanical and scenic values. Possibly the local KNF botanist, regional research scientist or a local college student at SOU, Humboldt State, or College of the Siskiyou's could conduct such an interesting study in fire ecology and natural fire recovery in the northern-most stand of foxtail pine. Fire exclusion is often cited as a threat to the local relict stands of endemic or disjunct conifer populations. Monitoring this hypothesis should be of high scientific value and could help inform management of fire in the enriched conifer stands of the Klamath-Siskiyou. Due to nearby location of the Lake Mountain lookout, the adjacent Botanical Area, and important research opportunity, the area should managed for natural recovery and proposed salvage unit 512 should be dropped from consideration in the Westside Fire Recovery Project.	Effects of logging on natural growth and recovery of plants, and post-fire soils, are addressed in the DEIS.

CR #	Concern Text	Letter #	Comment #	Comment Text	Response Text	
3	There is a concern that salvage logging in burned areas will inhibit natural growth and recovery of plants and will negatively impact fragile post-fire soils.	1651 1698	66	76	Unit 535: At the head of Rancheria Creek, a tributary of Grider Creek. Bordering the Grider Roadless Area. <b>Comment:</b> This unit consists of scattered groupings of large, green trees mostly pine mixed with cedar on wide spacing. The large trees generally grow in clump formation, indicating moderate severity fire effects in past fires. Live trees are mostly very fire adapted species in fire-generated structure. The stand is currently very fire adapted and is dominated by large, widely spaced trees of very fire resilient species. The stand is indicative of mixed severity fire effects on the upper one-third of this west-facing slope. Trees scorched in the Happy Camp Fire consist of mainly smaller trees and patches of large, overstory trees that should be retained as snags for habitat. In order to protect a currently fire adapted stand this unit should be dropped. The residual trees will likely be damaged in logging operations and should not be disturbed. (Cannot insert photo here - see attached) Fire adapted pine and cedar forest in unit 535 on the ridgeline above Rancheria Creek in the Grider Creek watershed. No salvage logging should take place in this watershed to protect ecological and recreational values. Much of the Rancheria Creek watershed burned in a wind driven stand-replacing event. Partially burned portions of the watershed with live residual trees should be retained. The stand is open and fire resilient and does not need logging treatments for "recovery." Unit 535 should be canceled.	Effects of logging on natural growth and recovery of plants, and post-fire soils, are addressed in the DEIS.
3	There is a concern that salvage logging in burned areas will inhibit natural growth and recovery of plants and will negatively impact fragile post-fire soils.	1698 1651 1698 1078	74 73	63 7	Unit 508: The unit is very large and stretches across sections 14 and 15 on the south face of Tom Martin Peak. <b>Comments:</b> The unit consists of numerous diverse plant communities, including true fir stands and Jeffery pine habitat. Much of the stand burned at low to moderate severity and sustained very little overstory mortality. In some areas small groupings of trees were "torched," but no large-scale stand replacing effects are evident. The fire effects in this stand are in no way outside the range of variability and the stand is not in need of "restoration" or "recovery" treatments. The unit also includes rock outcrop communities and a layer of rock mulch or scree covers much of the area; soil conditions in general are poor and the aspect is south and west. Site conditions for tree planting and establishment are poor. Natural regeneration will be more beneficial. Some areas consist of decomposed granite and should not be disturbed. Surface erosion is already evident due to the removal of duff and litter layers during the fire; logging disturbance would exasperate erosion concerns. The unit also supports serpentine woodlands and barren habitats. These habitats create interesting and abrupt transitions between more productive forested sites on granitic soils and low nutrient serpentine soils. These areas are highly diverse and scientifically interesting; they should be protected for salvage logging and tree planting activities. Throughout the stand fire severity was mixed including many sections of living trees in stands, groupings and as individuals. The fire effects were characteristic of high elevation conifer stands and should be allowed to recover naturally from the Happy Camp Fire. Fire effects were characteristic and beneficial; the fire severity is consistent with the agency's future desired condition, which includes the restoration of fire-adapted ecosystems. Unit 508 should be dropped from the project due to important botanical and geological values, the presence of healthy fire adapted plant communities and the beneficial fire effects sustained during the Happy Camp Fire. Red fir forest at over 6,000 in unit 508, much of the unit burned at low to moderate severity, yet is proposed for salvage logging. The unit sustained healthy and characteristic fire effects and is not in need of recovery. A low severity fire in unit 508 on the south face of Tom Martin Peak in red fir and Jeffery pine habitat. The abrupt transition zone between serpentine woodland and true fir forest on more productive soil is highly diverse and biologically significant. Notice the low levels of mortality in this stand proposed for salvage logging.	Effects of logging on natural growth and recovery of plants, and post-fire soils, are addressed in the DEIS.
5	There is a concern that salvage logging or planting within Inventoried Roadless Areas (IRA) fails to preserve roadless qualities within the IRA.	1129 1698 1698 1697 1698	17 87 33	84 17	I would also like to encourage the agency to consider the impact of salvage logging on uninventoried, yet undeniably roadless habitat, such as that which exists along the PCT in Grider Creek north of what is currently identified as the Grider IRA. This area was identified in the Forest Plan, Appendix C, as being an area of potential expansion and meeting roadless area criteria. It should be managed as roadless habitat and not subjected to salvage logging, especially due to the presence of the PCT. The Grider Creek Watershed should be thoughtfully considered for post fire management as it is a critical wildlife / fisheries / ecological area, consisting of large roadless areas. This watershed was uniquely affected by high fire severity and intensity over large contiguous blocks. There are no "local lumber mills" which this project will "provide timber to" with respect to the Salmon River Watershed, the Happy Camp Community or the Lower Scott River Community. This "economic" value should not be overstated in public documents. No salvage units in the Grider Creek drainage to protect roadless values, watershed values, scenic values, such as the Pacific Crest Trail (PCT) and connectivity between the Marble Mountains Wilderness, the Siskiyou Crest and the adjacent LSRs. No salvage units in the Grider Creek drainage to protect roadless values, watershed values, scenic values, such as the Pacific Crest Trail (PCT) and connectivity between the Marble Mountains Wilderness, the Siskiyou Crest and the adjacent LSRs. Numerous important values overlap in the Grider Creek watershed. As noted earlier the Grider Creek watershed and Grider Roadless Area provide important connectivity across the Klamath River from the Siskiyou Mountains to the Marble Mountains Wilderness. The corridor of habitat is particularly important due to the large complex of roadless and wilderness habitat adjacent to the watershed. The watershed has very high scenic and recreational values as the PCT travels north-south through the watershed from its headwaters in the Marble Mountains Wilderness to the community of Seiad Valley on the Klamath River. Much of the canyon supports old-growth forest that has been subjected to fires in 1987 and now in 2014. The result is a very fire adapted canyon bottom community of old-growth, mixed conifer forest. The watershed is a significantly large block of late seral habitat and should be allowed to recover naturally from the Happy Camp Fire. The area also supports two peregrine falcon eyries that should be protected from salvage logging. The ancient forest of the canyon supports northern spotted owls, Pacific fisher and other old-growth associates. The area also supports a strong run of steelhead, Coho salmon, and chinook salmon. Water quality is generally high, temperatures moderated by ancient forest canopy, and large wood contributed to the stream by large streamside snags and trees. These salmon runs must be protected by actions that reduce or mitigate erosion, sediment and turbidity concerns. This is especially important due to the sensitive and highly erosive granitic soil types and historic landslides in the area. Road development in the watershed should be avoided at all costs and logging units canceled throughout the watershed to avoid impacts to threatened fisheries.	Effects of salvage logging or planting on roadless characteristics within IRAs are addressed in the DEIS.

CR #	Concern Text	Letter #	Comment #	Comment Text	Response Text
5	There is a concern that salvage logging or planting within Inventoried Roadless Areas (IRA) fails to preserve roadless qualities within the IRA.	1651 1698	62 77	Unit 510: On north facing ridge dividing Mill Creek from Kuntz Creek. SE corner of section 9. <b>Comment:</b> Baker's cypress exists on the ridge dividing Mill and Kuntz Creek. The stand is one of only two populations south of the Klamath River and should be protected. I would recommend an approach similar to that outlined for unit 512, including monitoring and research into fire response and regeneration of this rare conifer species. Baker's cypress is generally adapted to colonize hot fires and sustain high severity type impacts. The species should regenerate and expand its population into nearby unsalvaged areas opened by moderate and high severity fire. The largest stand in the Klamath River drainage, on West Fork Seiad Creek, has expanded greatly due to a series of fires in 1951, 1987 and 2012. The impact of fire on regeneration is likely to create similar results in the post Happy Camp Fire environment. Newly opened stand and snag fields created by the Happy Camp Fire are potential habitat for this population expansion. Fire response and regeneration should be closely monitored and studied to create a clearer picture of this rare conifer's life cycle and history. Soil disturbance associated with salvage logging could very likely impact regeneration by damaging or destroying seedlings germinating shortly after the fire. Likewise fallen snags will create microclimate conditions that will encourage establishment and recovery of this species. This unit is listed as "Site preparation, planting and release" on the Vegetation Treatment Map, but marked "Salvage unit" on flagging at the unit. The unit would be accessed by a rocky ridge of green leaf manzanita and open grown, fire-scared incense cedar, and will likely be roaded to facilitate logging, the area is also in the Tom Martin Roadless Area. Due to roadless habitat and Baker's cypress habitat, unit 510 should be dropped from consideration.	Effects of salvage logging or planting on roadless characteristics within IRAs are addressed in the DEIS.
5	There is a concern that salvage logging or planting within Inventoried Roadless Areas (IRA) fails to preserve roadless qualities within the IRA.	1698 1697	89 18	No salvage units should be proposed in the following watersheds or areas to protect ecological values, scenic values, and recreational qualities within and adjacent to large Inventoried Roadless Areas or Wilderness Areas. This would include the following areas: (Happy Camp Fire: Grider Creek, N. Fork Kelsey Creek, McGuffy Creek, Kuntz Creek, Tom Martin Creek. Whites Fire: E. Fork Whites Gulch, Sixmile Creek, South Russian Creek, Tanners Peak area.	Effects of salvage logging or planting on roadless characteristics within IRAs are addressed in the DEIS.
10	There is a concern that the salvage of trees, outside of what is required for public safety and the protection of infrastructure, especially at high elevations, is not necessary and is detrimental to the natural recovery process and the forest will recover more slowly than if left unsalvaged.	1679 1651 1698 1697	7 18 75 22	No salvage logging in high elevation sites above 5,500', including mountain hemlock ( <i>Tsuga mertensiana</i> ), red fir ( <i>Abies magnifica</i> ), and white fir ( <i>Abies concolor</i> ) plant communities. These habitat types are adapted to long fire return intervals and relatively high severity fire effects. Scattered snag patches are natural, and due to the landscape location and short growing season, will recover slowly and create minimal fuels as succession takes place.	Effects of the salvage of trees on the likelihood and speed of recovery of the forest are addressed in the DEIS.
12	There is a concern that there are not enough fuel treatments, including fuel breaks, proposed in this project, especially around private property and in the Wildland Urban Interface but also along roadsides, along strategic ridgelines and around infrastructure.	1078	6	As usual, the natural fire was mostly a mosaic dominated by low intensity fire. the wind driven true black is there as well but the "devastation" is, for the most part, what was created during panic back firing. If the KNF had done the job to protect the communities and establish shaded fuel breaks on the Klamath-Scott and Klamath-Thompkins divides, that would not have been necessary. Has the FS ever done anything to deal with fuels around Scott Bar...to fireproof the community-forest interface? I can't remember a project. That too should be part of recovery, not chasing after big trees with green that - as research and experience on the ground in Grider in 87 shows - will survive if we can prevent you from logging them.	Additional fuels treatments have been added to Alternative 2, and a Alternative 5 addresses additional fuels treatments around private property in the Beaver Fire area. All alternatives in the DEIS specify number, size and location of fuels treatments, including fuel breaks, and disclose their effects on economics, safety and forest recovery.
12	There is a concern that there are not enough fuel treatments, including fuel breaks, proposed in this project, especially around private property and in the Wildland Urban Interface but also along roadsides, along strategic ridgelines and around infrastructure.	1160	5	I'm really concerned about not including the stand above Grider Creek Road in the proposal. It is a major fuels concentration right next to Seiad. I know its W&S river, Bald Eagle Mgt, and retention VQO, but none of those constraints outweigh the need to protect the community from the next big one 15 or 20 years out. It would be irresponsible for the FS to not treat this stand. The preferred treatment would be salvage, slashing, and subsequent underburning.	Additional fuels treatments have been added to Alternative 2, and a Alternative 5 addresses additional fuels treatments around private property in the Beaver Fire area. All alternatives in the DEIS specify number, size and location of fuels treatments, including fuel breaks, and disclose their effects on economics, safety and forest recovery.
12	There is a concern that there are not enough fuel treatments, including fuel breaks, proposed in this project, especially around private property and in the Wildland Urban Interface but also along roadsides, along strategic ridgelines and around infrastructure.	1136 1063	11 6	Develop shaded fuel breaks on major ridges separating drainages including Grider Ridge, the ridge between Lake Mountain and Tom Martin Peak, the ridge on the east side of the Grider Creek watershed and the ridge separating Tompkins Creek from the Scott River.	Additional fuels treatments have been added to Alternative 2, and a Alternative 5 addresses additional fuels treatments around private property in the Beaver Fire area. All alternatives in the DEIS specify number, size and location of fuels treatments, including fuel breaks, and disclose their effects on economics, safety and forest recovery.

CR #	Concern Text	Letter #	Comment #	Comment Text	Response Text
14	There is a concern that fire killed fuels and activity fuels pose a fire risk, especially for green trees, if not treated.	1094	12	First off, an important stand adjacent to Seiad Valley has unfortunately been omitted from the salvage logging proposal. This is the area above Grider Creek road in Section 24 between Caroline Creek and Walker Creek. A small part of the stand is proposed, but most if not all of Section 24 should be included for salvage. It is mature timber meeting the 50 - 100% basal area mortality criterion, is close to homes, and is excessively loaded with dead fuel (snags). Only a few small green patches are left within the matrix of dead trees. Leaving this whole area untreated would set the stage for a second fire in 10 to 30 years which would be very difficult to suppress, burn intensively hot, and threaten Seiad Valley. History has shown this "second hot fire" pattern in unsalvaged areas. Large snags will fall on brush and reproduction and are likely to burn before decomposing. Successful forest re-establishment will not occur until the background fuels from stand replacing fire are burned or removed. I am sure experts like Carl Skinner, Phil Witherspoon, and Jay Perkins would concur. Please have this discussion with your fuels staff. In addition, Wild and Scenic Rivers and Visual Quality Objectives constraining standards and guidelines should not trump community protection needs. I suggest that a Forest Plan amendment and discussion with Regional Office W and S Rivers personnel and Regional Forester may be necessary. There may be other areas like this near Happy Camp, Hamburg, Scott Bar, and Salmon River communities. Please take a more site specific look in these areas. Community protection objectives should be the highest priorities. Re-scope if necessary	Effects of alternatives on fire risk are addressed in the DEIS.
23	There is a concern that treatment in riparian areas will cause negative impacts to the watershed and specific activities to avoid this are recommended.	1698	79	Section 30 McGuffy Creek Unit: The unit as proposed consists of one large salvage logging unit stretching across the majority of McGuffy Creek. McGuffy Creek is mostly roadless and prior to the Happy Camp Fire supported mid and late seral habitat. A goshawk site was documented in the drainage in 1982 and should be protected from salvage logging. Likewise, the drainage was identified in the Lower Scott Ecosystem Analysis as a watershed that provides important connectivity between the Collins/Baldy LSR and the Seiad LSR (p.3-26). The massive scale of the proposed unit will create watershed wide impacts if implemented, including sedimentation, large-scale erosion, habitat fragmentation and the disruption of connectivity between LSR habitats. Portions of the unit are within areas mapped as dormant landslides and the toe zone of dormant landslides. The unit should be dropped.	Effects of treatments in riparian areas in the modified and clarified proposed action are addressed in the DEIS.
25	There is a concern that salvage logging or fuels treatment activities may result in erosion, landslides and sediment delivery to riparian areas or may result in the destruction of flora that provides watershed protection.	1698	75	Unit 506: Unit 506 is very large and drops into the headwall of McCarthy Gulch ground based near road, presumably helicopter below? <b>Comment:</b> In portions of the unit most of the large trees in this stand survived the fire. Fire severity was mixed. The upper portion of the unit is identified as "ground based" logging. The lower end is inaccessible and very steep; helicopter yarding will likely be required. The combination of steep, erosive slopes, poor access for slash and activity slash removal, and the limited impact salvage logging would have on future fire fighting efforts due to access and terrain limitations, the unit serves very little positive function on the landscape. The potential for environmental damage is high and the strategic potential for future fire fighting efforts is low. It is highly likely that fire crews would not be sent onto the steep slopes proposed for treatment, as the location of the unit would not provide for the creation of safe and effective fireline. Given the low likelihood of fire crews working in these dangerous conditions, the impact of firefighter safety is minimal at best. The unit should be dropped from consideration in the Westside Fire Recovery Project.	An alternative emphasizing watershed protection was developed. Effects of salvage logging and fuels treatments on erosion, landslides, sediment delivery to riparian areas and riparian vegetation are addressed in the DEIS.
29	There is a concern that logging trucks jake brakes will create a noise disturbance to homeowners along their route.	1076	1	He requested that the FS restrict logging trucks from using their "Jake Brakes" on Forest Road 12 (out of Doggett Creek) from the corral (approx. 3/8 of a mile west of Walker Bridge) to the intersection of Forest Road 12 and Highway 96. This is because the noise disturbance of the trucks affects him and his neighbor's quality of life.	Implementation direction address noise disturbance to homeowners from jake brakes.
33	There is a concern that restoring recreational features is not a part of this recovery project.	1078 1648	8 4	Remnants of the historic Tom Martin Trail once dissected a portion of the unit. The trail extended from Scott Bar to Lake Mountain Lookout and if reopened could be maintained as a strategic fuel brake on the high ridge dividing the Scott River from the Klamath River. The trail system restored could become a back-country fireline in times of need, but could be maintained with prescribed fire and perhaps some non-commercial manual treatments. An emphasis should be placed on retaining the back country/ roadless values of the Tom Martin Roadless Area while creating a fire safe ridgeline from which to stop/herd future fires, using MIST techniques. Local jobs could be created. Local recreational and economic opportunities through the continued maintenance of the trail system and fire fighters will have a more safe and effective ridgeline anchor between the Scott and Klamath River's. Include in one or more alternatives displayed and considered restoring the historic trail from Scott Bar to Lake Mountain as both a recreational trail, an historic resource and the anchor of a shaded fuelbreak on the ridge separating the Klamath and Lower Scott at lower elevations and the Klamath and Tompkins Creek watershed at the higher elevations. Restoring this historical trail as a feature of a shaded fuel break would provide recreational and economic benefits to Scott Bar and other Lower Scott and Mid-Klamath River communities. Restoring recreational resources should be a feature of Recovery	Rationale for the scope of the project is provided in the DEIS.
39	Comments received that are beyond the scope of the project.	1087	1	We have property between Seiad Valley and Hamburg. We lost hundreds of feet of water line that were supposed to be protected from a clearing/controlled burn near O'Neil Creek a while back. The burn never happened (until the Happy Camp fire).	These are beyond the scope of this project but will be considered by the Forest in other projects or plans, as appropriate.

CR #	Concern Text	Letter #	Comment #	Comment Text	Response Text
44	Comments received that suggest something already addressed in a PDF or alternative or something that will be addressed in analysis.	1653	1	It has come to my attention that the KNF has proposed extensive logging and plantation establishment within the Grider Biological Corridor, including within roadless lands adjacent to the Grider Creek Inventoried Roadless Area. Those roadless lands should have been included as part of the inventoried Grider Creek Roadless Area. The Grider Creek corridor is a largely roadless landscape which provides a biological linkage between the Marble Mountain Wilderness and the Red Buttes Wilderness via the Kangaroo Roadless Area. The Forest Service created this corridor by radically fragmenting forest habitat on both sides of the Grider Creek Drainage via clearcutting, road building and the establishment of tree plantations. If Forest Service decision makers insist on attempting to log and establish large and highly flammable tree plantations in this landscape linkage and biological corridor you must fully analyze and disclose the impacts those activities would have on the functioning of the area as a biological corridor for the movement of species, on biodiversity and on genetic diversity of the plants and animals which find habitat on the Klamath National Forest. In performing that analysis you must utilize the best available scientific information. Recent research has confirmed that wildlife corridors function well and are increasingly needed by wildlife and plants. If you insist on trying to log and establish large tree plantations within the Grider Creek Watershed you must also fully analyze and disclose the impact of climate change on the species which utilize the Grider Creek corridor/landscape linkage and how the activities you propose would impact the ability of those species to utilize the corridor/linkage, including but not limited to the ability of those species to maintain genetic diversity over time. If you insist on trying to log and establish vast tree plantations in the Grider Creek watershed you must also analyze and disclose how those activities will impact the risk that a future wildfire would damage the species, habitat and genetic connectivity provided by the Grider Creek corridor/linkage. This must include disclosing the creation of fuel "jackpots" as a result of helicopter logging without adequate post logging fuel treatment. If you decide on fuel treatment within helicopter logging units you must disclose whether that fuel treatment will be required in the timber sale contract or whether you will seek funding for helicopter logging slash treatment. If funding must be requested for those treatments you must disclose the likelihood that the funding would be forthcoming. This is especially important because during previous salvage logging operations KNF managers claimed in their decision documents that they would abate highly flammable helicopter logging slash but failed to deliver what was promised because they did not put slash treatment requirements into the timber sale contracts.	Alternative 2 and Project Design Features, created to minimize impacts, include information that addresses these comments; clarification has been provided in the DEIS.
44	Comments received that suggest something already addressed in a PDF or alternative or something that will be addressed in analysis.	1702	7	The Taylor family, owners of Round Mountain Ranch, would like to take this opportunity to comment on the proposed post fire recovery efforts set forth by the Klamath NF. Our property is located in section 36, to the North of Fish Gulch on Round Mountain up Beaver Creek. We are in support of the proposed actions identified thus far in your proposal. We are happy that dead trees will be logged along the road systems. The road that we are most concerned with is 47N39. We would greatly appreciate fuels reduction adjacent to our property with priority given to SE (downhill) of us. Carl Verick (Oak Knoll silviculturalist) had a project years ago where brush was masticated adjacent to us and replanted with pines. We would like to see similar re-vegetation efforts included in your proposal with fore thought being given to the protection of hardwood species like Oregon white oak and California black oak as these seem to be a bit less flammable than dense young conifer plantations with 8x8 spacing.	Alternative 2 and Project Design Features, created to minimize impacts, include information that addresses these comments; clarification has been provided in the DEIS.
50	Concern with the effects of the proposed action, as scoped, on fire and fuels.	1698	30	Ridges including Grider Ridge along road 46N77, the eastern ridge dividing Grider Creek and Tompkins Creek along road 46N64 and 46N43, the divide between the Scott River and Klamath River between Lake Mountain and Tom Martin Peak, and Frying Pan Ridge should be considered for treatment.	Effects of the modified proposed action and alternatives on fire and fuels are addressed in the DEIS. Also see response to Concerns 6, 11, 13 and 14.
52	Concern with the effects of the proposed action on Aquatic Conservation Strategy objectives and flooding and sediment in streams, especially in relation to safety and community protection.	1129	5	The consideration of anadromous fisheries needs to be more seriously considered, particularly in the Scott, Grider and Elk Creek Drainages	Effects of the modified proposed action and alternatives on Aquatic Conservation Strategy, safety and community protection related to flooding and sediment are addressed as part of the social effects in the DEIS.
52	Concern with the effects of the proposed action on Aquatic Conservation Strategy objectives and flooding and sediment in streams, especially in relation to safety and community protection.	1702	5	It is important to us that the area along 47N39 road and around our property not only have salvage logging, brush and fuels reduction, re-planting, but that the roads be adequately upgraded with rolling dips and large culverts be installed at the crossings. There is already lots of silt and dirt being removed off the roads due to rains and it would be great to see an investment made in this road to ensure its longevity and ease of use.	Effects of the modified proposed action and alternatives on Aquatic Conservation Strategy, safety and community protection related to flooding and sediment are addressed as part of the social effects in the DEIS.

CR #	Concern Text	Letter #	Comment #	Comment Text	Response Text
56	Concerns with the effects of the proposed action, as scoped, on roadless characteristics of Inventoried Roadless Areas.	1698	34	<p>The impact to connectivity between wildland tracts (roadless and wilderness). The impact of proposed salvage logging and planting treatments in the Russian IRA, Snoozer IRA and Grider IRA and adjacent uninventoried roadless lands have a disproportionate impact to habitat values due to the connectivity these areas provide between roadless and wilderness tracts. All three roadless areas have been identified as providing excellent connectivity in Appendix C of the Forest Plan. This impact must be analyzed in the Westside EIS. The Russian Roadless Area provides connectivity between the North Fork of the Salmon River, the Marble Mountains Wilderness, the Russian Wilderness and the Trinity Alps. The Forest Plan (p. C-63) states: "The unmanaged, closed canopy wildlife habitat in the area makes it an important connection between the Marble Mountains Wilderness and the Trinity Alps Wilderness." This connectivity should not be impacted by salvage logging as it provides a necessary landscape linkage between wild areas. The Snoozer Roadless Area provides "a link of unroaded habitats between the Russian and Marble Mountains Wildernesses, including the lower reach of the North Fork of the Salmon River. This area also provides suitable habitat for the other older mature seral stage MIS. There is a historical wolverine sighting in the area." Units are proposed in this roadless area in Robinson Gulch and should be canceled. The Grider Roadless Area is identified on page C-24 of the Forest Plan as representing "a corridor of relatively uninterrupted late seral habitat. The corridor connects the Marble Mountains Wilderness in the south to the Klamath River and the unroaded Fort Goff Creek and Portuguese Creek drainages to the north." This corridor connects the Marble Mountains to the Siskiyou Crest and is an important north-south corridor across the Klamath River. Together the Russian Roadless Area, Snoozer Roadless Area and Grider Roadless Area provide vital landscape connectivity from the Trinity Alps and Russian Wilderness Areas to the Marble Mountains Wilderness, and across the Klamath River to the Red Buttes Wilderness and the Siskiyou Mountains, which provide connectivity to the Coast Range and the Cascade Mountains. On a landscape and regional scale the Grider and Russian Roadless Areas provide a vital link in the chain of connectivity across the Klamath-Siskiyou. The cumulative impact of proposed salvage logging to this connectivity corridor should be thoroughly analyzed. The impact of salvage logging to connectivity between IRAs should be analyzed in the EIS, as most roadless areas have been salvage logged, in many places severing the connectivity between IRAs and between IRAs and wilderness areas</p>	Effects of Alternative 2 and the other alternatives on the roadless character of IRAs are addressed in the DEIS. Also see response to Concern 5.