

CHAPTER 2 – ALTERNATIVES

Key Terms

Carrying capacity (recreation) – Carrying capacity is the estimated number of users that can be accommodated, in a given area, without a loss in the quality of the natural environment or the recreation experience.

Commercial use or activity – Any use or activity on National Forest System lands (a) where an entry or participation fee is charged or (b) where the primary purpose is the sale of a good or service and, in either case, regardless of whether the use or activity is intended to produce a profit (36 CFR 251.51) (FSH 2709.11, 41.53d).

General forest – For this analysis, general forest is any area that is outside of a developed recreation site.

Home range – Home range is a recreation area near a community that is especially important to local residents. Generally, a home range on the Petersburg Ranger District is within a fifteen mile radius of the communities of Petersburg, Kake, Port Protection or Point Baker. Home range recreation places are easy to get to for day trips and receive a fair amount of use. Travel time and the amount of exposed water are factors that limit or extend home range.

Hunt – A hunt is an authorization for one guided client on National Forest System lands for the purpose of hunting one or more species in one general geographic area. A hunt does not typically exceed 10 days in length and can be considerably less based on the species pursued. A hunt is an authorization for a land use activity which may or may not result in the harvest of an animal.

Mitigation – Measures designed to counteract or reduce environmental impacts.

Recreation Opportunity Spectrum (ROS) – A system for planning and managing recreation. It categorizes recreation opportunities into seven classes.

Recreation Place – Areas within a study area that include a recreation attractor, such as a trail, a lake, a beach, or a popular fishing stream.

Recreation Visitor Days (RVDs) – One RVD is equal to 12 hours of recreation use on National Forest System lands or water by an outfitted or guided client(s). One RVD may be one client for 12 hours, 12 clients for one hour, or any combination that equals 12 hours of use on National Forest System lands.

Service Day – A day or any part of a day on National Forest System lands for which an outfitter or guide provides services to a client. One client on the National Forest for 15 minutes in one day is equivalent to one service day. One client on the National Forest for 24 hours in one day is also equivalent to one service day.

Study Area – The PRD is divided into 20 study areas and is made up of recreation places and general forest. Study area boundaries were determined using the Forest Plan, Value Comparison Units (VCUs), ROS Classes, and Watershed Analysis Areas. It is at the study area scale that the Forest Service tracks actual use data submitted by permitted commercial operators.

2 Alternatives



Kayaks at Happy Cove, Petersburg Ranger District. Photograph by Carin Christensen.

Introduction

This chapter summarizes the development of alternatives considered by the Forest Service to meet the purpose and need and respond to the significant issues described in Chapter 1. Two alternatives are discussed in detail. The alternatives include the Proposed Action (Alternative 1) and the Increased Solitude Alternative (Alternative 2).

There will not be a No-Action alternative in this analysis due to the study area boundary changes made during the update to the Petersburg Recreation Use Carrying Capacity Report. The boundary changes do not allow for a meaningful comparison of past and proposed management actions. Instead, alternatives will be compared to the existing condition, which is represented by five years of actual use numbers (2004-2008) for the newly drawn study area boundaries (FSH 1909.15, Chapter 41.22).

Existing Condition

Actual use by commercial outfitters and guides is recorded annually by study area and is used in this analysis to describe the existing condition of commercial recreation use on the district. The average actual use by outfitters and guides for 2004-2008 was 4,257 RVDs. The following table shows a breakdown of annual use by season.

Table 2.1. Average actual use by commercial outfitters and guides on the Petersburg Ranger District. Data shown is from 2004-2008.

| Spring (April 1 – May 31) | Summer (June 1 – Aug 31) | Fall (Sept 1 – Oct 31) | Winter (Nov 1 – Mar 31) | Annual |
|------------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|------------|
| 361 RVDs | 3,450 RVDs | 380 RVDs | 66 RVDs | 4,257 RVDs |
| 8% | 81% | 9% | 2% | 100% |

The annual five-year actual use average is approximately 11 percent of what is available to outfitters and guides in both action alternatives (39,605 RVDs). See Table 2.3 for a comparison of actual use numbers and proposed allocation numbers by season and alternative.

For detailed descriptions and maps of each study area and recreation place, see Appendix A (Part II) of this document.

Alternatives Considered in Detail

Alternative 1 – Proposed Action

The action proposed to meet the purpose and need is to authorize outfitter and guide operations through the issuance of special use permits, based on the Petersburg

2 Alternatives

Recreation Use Carrying Capacity Report. In this alternative the district proposes to allocate outfitter and guides up to 10 percent of the capacity within an identified home range and 25 percent outside an identified home range¹⁰. These allocations would be proportioned out by season; 10 percent in the spring, 65 percent in the summer, 15 percent in the fall and 10 percent in the winter (Table 2.3). Allocation by season puts greater limitations on commercial use in the spring and fall, aims to reduce user conflicts by providing more opportunities for solitude and helps indirectly manage outfitter and guide recreation use by activity (i.e., spring and fall outfitter and guide use is mostly for guided black bear hunting).

The proposal would authorize up to approximately 39,605 RVDs across the district for use by outfitters and guides (3,961 RVDs in the spring, 25,743 RVDs in the summer, 5,941 RVDs in the fall and 3,961 RVDs in the winter). The use authorized may be temporary in nature (less than one year) or could be for multiple years. For those operators who have demonstrated satisfactory performance, the District Ranger may issue priority use permits, for a period of up to 10 years, in accordance with FSH 2709.11.

Response to Issues

Issue 1: *Provide stable business opportunities for the outfitter and guide industry.*

Eleven percent of the total RVDs available in the project area will be allocated to outfitters and guides. All but one of the study areas¹¹ have significantly lower actual use numbers than the proposed allocated use, which would allow for the growth of the outfitter and guide industry and help provide stable business opportunities.

Issue 2: *Adequately address conflicts within the outfitter and guide industry.*

In the past, user conflicts have been reported in the spring and fall. Allocating use by season allows the Petersburg Ranger District to set outfitter and guide use levels close to actual use during the time of year when conflicts have occurred. As a result, there may be more opportunities for solitude with fewer user conflicts (i.e., a better recreation experience).

Alternative 2 – Increased Solitude

This alternative provides a greater opportunity for recreation experiences with solitude in two study areas that have had reported user conflicts. In particular, it is designed to limit conflict among black bear hunting guides and between black bear hunting guides and fishing guides in the spring and fall.

¹⁰ The allocation of 10% and 25% is by recreation place, not by study area.

¹¹ In Study Area 6 (Kupreanof Island – North Shore) the average actual use is higher than the proposed allocated use. Approximately 90 percent of the use is by one outfitter and guide in one recreation site. No user conflicts or resource damage has been reported at the site.

In Alternative 2 RVD allocation is the same as Alternative 1, except that Study Areas 12A (Saginaw/Security/Washington Bays) and 14 (Keku Strait/Port Camden) have a smaller percentage of use allocated to the spring (7 percent) and fall (10 percent) seasons (Table 2.3). As a result, outfitters and guides use is more restricted in the spring and fall in Saginaw/Security/Washington Bays and Keku Strait/Port Camden.

Response to Issues

Issue 1: *Provide stable business opportunities for the outfitter and guide industry.*

Eleven percent of the total RVDs available in the project area will be allocated to outfitters and guides. All but one of the study areas¹² have significantly lower actual use numbers than the proposed allocated use, which would allow for the growth of the outfitter and guide industry.

The increased restriction of outfitter and guide use in Study Areas 12A and 14 in the spring and fall seasons may provide greater business stability for the industry by providing an improved recreation experience for clients.

Issue 2: *Adequately address conflicts within the outfitter and guide industry.*

By further restricting outfitter and guide use in Study Areas 12A and 14 in the spring and fall seasons, this alternative aims to reduce user conflicts in these areas by setting allocated use closer to actual use, thereby not allowing for an increase in outfitter and guide use.

Action Common to Both Alternatives

Currently the annual actual use for all study areas on the Petersburg Ranger District is less than what is proposed in either action alternative (Table 2.3). However, if a study area nears or exceeds recreation carrying capacity in the future, the Petersburg Ranger District will allocate a percentage of outfitter and guide RVDs by season to temporary and priority use pools as directed in FSH 2709.11 (41.53k and 41.53n). The process of allocating a percentage of use to the temporary and priority use pools will be determined by the authorized officer who, in this situation, is the Petersburg District Ranger (ibid.).

Mitigations

General Mitigation (All Areas)

The following mitigations are currently required within the Outfitter and Guide Special Use Permit. These standard mitigations are in addition to those listed by study area in Table 2.2.

¹² In Study Area 6 (Kupreanof Island – North Shore) the average actual use is higher than the proposed allocated use. Approximately 90 percent of the use is by one outfitter and guide in one recreation site. No user conflicts or resource damage has been reported at the site.

2 Alternatives

- Land ownership is mixed and it is the responsibility of the permit holder to determine ownership and obtain proper authorization for use of private, Native Corporation, and/or local government-held lands.
- Outfitters and guides will incorporate *Leave No Trace* skills¹³ into all activities on National Forest Lands.
- Outfitter guide camps are prohibited within one mile of any Forest Service recreation cabin unless specifically authorized by the permit.
- Outfitter and guide use of public use recreation cabins or their amenities (e.g. skiffs, firewood, fire rings) is prohibited unless specifically authorized by the permit.
- All campfires should be built below high tide, as mound fires (a *Leave No Trace* technique¹³) or in firepans.
- Within designated Wilderness, no more than 12 people (including guides) can occupy a site at one time, unless specifically authorized by the permit. “Site” is defined as an area on the National Forest occupied by persons not within sight and sound of other Forest users.
- Beach Meadows: Outfitters and guides will not establish camps, or allow their clients to camp in these areas. When walking through these areas, people should stay on existing paths and game trails to avoid trampling or damaging vegetation in beach meadows. Located at the margin between marine beaches and the forest fringe, beach meadows are characterized by the presence of tall grasses, beach pea, Indian paintbrush, Pacific silverweed, yarrow, chocolate lily, pretty shooting star, and Nootka lupine. These meadows often have between 20-40 different plant species, some of which are on the sensitive species list.
- Impacts on Bald Eagle Nest Sites: The Forest Service and the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service have a Memorandum of Understanding which establishes a minimum 330-foot radius habitat management zone around each bald eagle nest tree. Guided groups are prohibited from camping in this zone.

Mitigation by Study Area

Some areas have special concerns due to competition between outfitter and guide groups and other unguided forest users, resource impacts from increased use, or the area is already under a special use permit. Table 2.2 lists the mitigation measures by study area. Refer to Figure 1 for study area location.

¹³ For more information about Leave No Trace principles, visit:

http://www.fs.fed.us/r10/outdoor_ethics/leave_no_trace/intro/lnt_principles_v2.shtml or the Leave No Trace website: http://www.geocities.com/yosemite/falls/9200/leave_no_trace.html

Table 2.2. Mitigation measures by study area.

| Study area | Location | Recreation Place | Concern | Mitigation |
|------------|---|--|--|--|
| 1 | Blind Slough Picnic Area, Manmade Hole Recreation Area, Trumpeter Swan Observatory, Mitkof Island | 21004.00 | Groups over 20 people at recreation sites, from June to September | Outfitter/guide groups are limited to 20 people (including guides) from June 1 through September 30. |
| 1 | Blind River Rapids Trail and Ohmer Creek Interpretive Trail, Mitkof Island | 21004.00 | Groups over 20 people at recreation sites. | Tours exceeding 20 people (including guides) at one time shall break up into groups not to exceed 20 people (including guides). A separation of at least 15 minutes between groups will be maintained. Operators conducting tours with over 20 people (including guides) at one time are encouraged to contact other outfitters/guides that use these sites to work out schedules that will help avoid crowding. |
| 2 | Castle River | 21042.01 | High use of best fishing areas by outfitter and guide groups during peak season. | Outfitter and guide freshwater fishing on Castle River is limited to Monday through Friday. No weekend use will be authorized. |
| 2 | Kah Sheets Creek | 21045.00 | High use of best fishing areas by outfitter and guide groups during peak season. | Outfitter and guide freshwater fishing on Kah Sheets Creek is limited to Monday through Friday. No weekend use will be authorized. |
| | | 21045.01 | | |
| | | 21045.02 | | |
| 5 | Harvey Lake | 21128.01 | Outfitter and guide impacts on unguided users at public recreation cabin. | Outfitter/guide activities are restricted to the beach area of the lake. Groups will stay as far away from the Harvey Lake recreation cabin as practical to avoid disturbing cabin users. Group size is limited to no more than 40 people (including guides). Tours exceeding 40 people shall break into groups not to exceed 40 people. A separation of at least 15 minutes between groups will be maintained. |
| 7 | Petersburg Creek – Duncan Salt Chuck Wilderness | All rec. places within this Wilderness | Outfitter and guide impacts on unguided users and resources. | Group size limited to 12 people (including guides) at one time unless specifically authorized. |

2 Alternatives

| Study area | Location | Recreation Place | Concern | Mitigation |
|------------|---|--|--|--|
| 7 | Petersburg Lake Trail and Petersburg Mountain Trail | All rec. places along these trails | Outfitter/guide impacts on private land owners adjacent to trails. | Use of the Petersburg Lake Trail and the Petersburg Mountain Trail involve the use of six-foot wide trail easements through private property. Use adjacent to private property along these trails is limited to this easement. Tours exceeding 20 people (including guides) at one time shall break up into groups not to exceed 20 people (including guides). A separation of at least 15 minutes between groups will be maintained. |
| 7 | Petersburg Creek | 21054.12 | Noise from motorized boats in the Wilderness. Impacts from boat wakes on stream banks. | Outfitters and guides on Petersburg Creek will minimize motorized boat use above the high tide trailhead, and will not be permitted above the log jam (1.8 miles upstream from the Wilderness boundary). |
| 10 | Agate Beach | 21146.00 | Resources | Collecting agates and other material on National Forest System lands adjacent to Agate Beach is prohibited. |
| 13 | Kuiu Wilderness | All rec. places within this Wilderness | Outfitter and guide impacts on unguided users and resources | Group size limited to 12 people (including guides) at one time unless specifically authorized. |
| 13 | Tebenkof Bay Wilderness | All rec. places within this Wilderness | Outfitter and guide impacts on unguided users and resources | Group size limited to 12 people (including guides) at one time unless specifically authorized. |
| 14 | Kadake Creek | 21081.01 21081.02 | High use of best fishing areas by outfitter and guide groups during peak season. | Outfitter and guide freshwater fishing on Kadake Creek is limited to Monday through Friday. No weekend use will be authorized. |
| 22 | Cascade Creek, Thomas Bay | 21019.00 | Outfitter and guide impacts on unguided users at public recreation cabin. | Outfitters and guides intending to hike Cascade Creek Trail may not put their clients ashore at the beach adjacent to the Forest Service recreation cabin. Clients must go ashore near the trailhead at the mouth of Cascade Creek. |

Mitigation by Resource

Botany

Impacts of recreational users on all types of vegetation are mitigated by informal surveys of recreation sites by district recreation staff, permit requirements that include *Leave No Trace*¹⁴ best practices and permit stipulations. *Leave No Trace* practices minimize damage to vegetation and should effectively confine damage to areas already impacted. Most impacts to dispersed campsites consist of trash and discarded materials which are easily cleaned up with little to no permanent impacts.

Informational pamphlets describing some of the most aggressive invasive plants in Alaska will be distributed to outfitters and guides to increase their awareness of invasive plants and to encourage them to report any infestations they find. Recreation staff is sufficiently trained in plant identification to recognize invasive plants during their surveys of recreation sites.

Cultural Resources

The Forest Service has determined that a finding of No Historic Properties Affected is appropriate for this project. Our Programmatic Agreement (2002) with the State Historic Preservation Officer and the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation recognizes that the undertakings this EA addresses have little to no potential to affect historic properties because of their nature and size. Outfitter and Guide compliance with permit stipulations that require *Leave No Trace*¹⁴ practices and a post-activity site monitoring plan will mitigate potential effects to historic properties.

Karst and Cave Resources

The Petersburg Ranger District has a limited but significant cave¹⁵ resource. All outfitter and guide permits will be monitored to determine if they are using or affecting the cave resource. The monitoring will determine the number of outfitters and guides operating on known karst landforms¹⁶ and of these how many are using caves as part of their permit.

Wilderness

To address concerns due to competition between outfitter and guide groups, as well as with other unguided forest users, mitigation measures were developed to reduce conflicts

¹⁴ For more information about *Leave No Trace* principles, visit: http://www.fs.fed.us/r10/outdoor_ethics/leave_no_trace/intro/lnt_principles_v2.shtml or the *Leave No Trace* website: http://www.geocities.com/yosemite/falls/9200/leave_no_trace.html

¹⁵ *Cave* is any naturally occurring void, cavity, recess, or system of interconnected passages which occurs beneath the surface of the earth or within a cliff or ledge and which is large enough to permit an individual to enter whether or not the entrance is naturally formed or human made.

¹⁶ *Karst landforms* are any irregular limestone regions with sinkholes, collapse channels, underground streams, caves, and caverns.

2 Alternatives

and control resource impacts. The Mitigation Measures are included with all Outfitter and Guide Special Use Permits as Special Stipulations and therefore become part of the permit. Failure to adhere to the Special Stipulations would be a violation of the terms in the Special Use Authorization and could lead to the suspension, revocation or termination of the permit.

Mitigation measures:

1. Campsites will be located at least one mile from recreation cabins, unless specifically authorized in the permit.
2. Campsites will be located on durable surfaces, unless specifically provided for otherwise in the permit.
3. Campfires will be with firepans, below high tideline not on vegetation, or as mound fires; all fires will apply *Leave No Trace* techniques.
4. Use Reports will reflect specific locations of use.
5. In the Tebenkof Bay and Kuiu Wilderness areas, remain at least 100 yards (length of football field) from whales, dolphins, porpoises; and sea otters, seals and sea lions that are on land, or rock (Alaska Marine Mammal Viewing Guidelines).
6. Outfitters and guides will be encouraged to work together to minimize conflicts by scheduling trips to avoid working in the same areas at the same time.
7. Outfitters and guides on Petersburg Creek will be encouraged to minimize impacts from motorized traffic on the creek. Commercially guided, motorized use will be minimized above the high tide trailhead and not permitted above the log jam (1.8 miles upstream from the Wilderness boundary).

The FAA requests that all aircraft maintain a 2,000 minimum altitude above the surface of the lands and waters of the congressionally designated wilderness areas identified on the sectional aeronautical charts. Safety is a factor and the recommendations do not supersede pilot decisions for the operation of the aircraft.

Mitigation measures/special stipulations will continue to evolve in response to current conditions/trends and will continue to be used as a management tool to respond to impacts or conflicts that become apparent during the monitoring efforts.

Wildlife

The state is responsible for the management, protection, maintenance, enhancement, rehabilitation, and extension of the fish and wildlife resources for the State of Alaska based on the sustained yield principle. The Federal Subsistence Board is responsible for ensuring that the taking of fish and wildlife on federal public lands for non wasteful subsistence uses shall be given priority over the taking of fish and wildlife on such lands for other purposes (Federal Subsistence Board 2008).

The Forest Service and the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service have a Memorandum of Understanding which establishes a minimum 330-foot radius habitat management zone around each bald eagle nest tree. Guided groups are prohibited from camping in this zone.

The National Marine Fisheries Service establishes regulation to manage and protect marine mammals. Enforcement of these regulations is provided by the National Marine Fisheries Service and the United States Coast Guard. Special use permits require compliance with all federal, state, and local laws and regulations. Outfitter and guide compliance with the marine mammal regulations will mitigate potential impacts to these species.

Mountain goat kidding and wintering habitat will receive protection from aircraft disturbance. Current mitigation by the State of Alaska and the Forest Service for permitted or approved flights requires 1,500 feet vertical and horizontal clearance from such areas and 2,000 feet if flying over wilderness. Flights over kidding areas will be avoided between May 15 and June 15, and between November 15 and December 15, during the breeding season.

While hunting is allowed, populations of waterfowl and shorebirds will continue to be protected by implementing the standards and guidelines provided in the 2008 Forest Plan.

Implementation

The success of implementation is a function of adequate staffing for enforcement, education and awareness, and the cooperation of permit holders. The amount of field administration needed will likely vary depending upon the use by permit holders, the compliance to conditions of the permits, and behavior of forest users on the Petersburg Ranger District. Where observed uses do not conform to the management of the National Forest, administrative actions (such as permit suspension, revocation, or termination) may occur. Depending upon the severity of the actions, legal actions could and may be taken as appropriate to correct the problem.

Monitoring

Monitoring and evaluation provide the public and the Forest Service with information on the progress and results of implementing National Forest management decisions. Monitoring and evaluation comprise an essential feedback mechanism to help be responsive to changing conditions. There are two distinct types of monitoring: implementation and effectiveness. Implementation monitoring determines if the permitted activities comply with adopted standards and guidelines: “Did we do what we said we would?” Effectiveness monitoring determines whether the standards and guidelines achieve desired results: “Were the results what we expected?”

Implementation and effectiveness monitoring will be accomplished through the administration of the special use permits issued as a result of this decision. These measures include:

- 1) Special use permits authorized will be monitored as described in Forest Service Handbook 2709.11. This monitoring will consist of routine inspections for permit compliance and compliance with State and Federal regulations.

2 Alternatives

- 2) Field inspections of special use permit operations or approved use areas.

Field inspections of a permit holder's operations or approved use will be necessary to ensure compliance with permit provisions. Inspections of approved use areas would provide information regarding site conditions and whether or not additional administrative actions are required.

Permit holders are required to provide actual use reports¹⁷ to the Forest Service within 30 days of the end of their operating season.

- 3) Information provided by the yearly use reports will be compiled and available to all resource disciplines or other areas as requested.

Aquatics

Forest Service staff can readily identify high-use sport fishing locations because outfitters and guides are required to report their activities on National Forest System lands.

Periodic site visits to sport fishing locations by district fishery biologists or hydrologists help evaluate resource status and determine if additional administrative controls or rehabilitations are necessary to protect aquatic resources.

Botany

Botanists will periodically visit a sample of recreation places and follow standard survey protocols to search for sensitive and rare plants. If any sensitive or rare plants are found, mitigation measures would be implemented at that time on a case-by-case basis. These plant surveys would also be used to document any invasive species present. If invasive species are found, measures to control or prevent further spread of the populations would be recommended based on site criteria, such as the invasiveness of the species, size of the population, and the control methods appropriate for the site.

Cultural Resources

Although Forest Service archeologists have determined that recreational activities will not affect sites eligible to the National Register of Historic Places, monitoring can help ensure that the operation of such activities do not adversely affect cultural resources through soil disturbance, rutting, compaction and erosion. Monitoring also addresses issues of outfitter and guide use that may increase the potential for deliberate looting or inadvertent disturbance of fragile sites.

Prior to the start of a season, most outfitters and guides are uncertain exactly where they may take clients on any given day. Factors such as weather, sea conditions and the presence of other people all influence ultimately where an outfitter and guide may take clients. All outfitter and guide permit holders are required to submit annual use and location reports. This information will continue to enable us to visit known use areas.

¹⁷ *Actual use reports* A form completed by outfitter and guide permit holders and submitted to the District Office at the end of the holder's operating season. The form includes the following information: date(s) of use, number of clients, location(s), and a description of the activity(s) at each location.

Archeologists will periodically visit a sample of use areas and follow standard monitoring protocols. They will conduct a visual inspection of the use area, focusing particular attention on areas with known cultural resources. Soil probes and other subsurface tests may be used to determine the integrity of buried sites. Photographic reference or waypoints will be established at each monitored location to serve as a visual baseline as future visits are made. Information gathered during monitoring will be recorded on standard forest monitoring forms that will be kept on file. Maps, drawings and other references will also be collected to gauge future site conditions.

Summary

Implementation and monitoring of special use permits is a part of the ongoing management of resources at the district level. The programs and strategies used to manage resources include education and awareness, field visits, site inspections, and visitor feedback. Methods may vary depending upon resources that are impacted.

If the threshold limits are reached or social and/or environmental issues become a concern, additional use may not be authorized until further site specific review is completed. This review will include all active permits including priority use permits and all pending permit applications.



Fog over the Sukoi Islands in Frederick Sound. Photograph by Heath Whitacre.

Comparison of Alternatives

Table 2.3. Summary of actual use (existing condition) and proposed recreation visitor days (RVDs) available to outfitters and guides in Alternatives 1 and 2. Existing Condition numbers are the average RVDs reported from 2004-2008. RVDs available to outfitters and guides in Alternative 1 (Proposed Action) are proportioned out by season; 10 percent in the spring, 65 percent in the summer, 15 percent in the fall and 10 percent in the winter. RVDs in Alternative 2 are proportioned out by season the same way as Alternative 1 except with reduced allocations in the spring and fall in Study Areas 12A and 14; 7 percent in the spring, 73 percent in the summer, 10 percent in the fall and 10 percent in the winter.

| Study Area | Comparison | Recreation Visitor Days | | | | |
|--|-----------------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|
| | | Spring (April 1 – May 31) | Summer (June 1 – Aug 30) | Fall (Sept 1 – Oct 31) | Winter (Nov 1 – Mar 31) | Total Annual ¹ |
| 1 Mitkof Island | Existing Condition | 22 | 391 | 16 | 0 | 429 |
| | Proposed Action and Alternative 2 | 1,278 | 8,308 | 1,917 | 1,278 | 12,781 |
| 2 Duncan Canal – West Side | Existing Condition | 4 | 60 | 2 | 0 | 66 |
| | Proposed Action and Alternative 2 | 112 | 729 | 168 | 112 | 1,122 |
| 4 Duncan Canal – East Side | Existing Condition | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| | Proposed Action and Alternative 2 | 50 | 324 | 75 | 50 | 499 |
| 5 Wrangell Narrows/Woewodski Is | Existing Condition | 0 | 27 | 4 | 0 | 31 |
| | Proposed Action and Alternative 2 | 175 | 1,136 | 262 | 175 | 1,747 |

| Study Area | Comparison | Recreation Visitor Days | | | | |
|---|-----------------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|
| | | Spring (April 1 – May 31) | Summer (June 1 – Aug 30) | Fall (Sept 1 – Oct 31) | Winter (Nov 1 – Mar 31) | Total Annual ¹ |
| 6 Kupreanof Island – North Shore | Existing Condition | 6 | 349 ² | 8 | 0 | 363 |
| | Proposed Action and Alternative 2 | 45 | 291 | 67 | 45 | 448 |
| 7 Petersburg Ck/Duncan Salt Chuck | Existing Condition | 35 | 179 | 14 | 0 | 228 |
| | Proposed Action and Alternative 2 | 126 | 821 | 189 | 126 | 1,263 |
| 8 North Lindenberg Peninsula | Existing Condition | 11 | 151 | 37 | 8 | 207 |
| | Proposed Action and Alternative 2 | 137 | 892 | 206 | 137 | 1,373 |
| 9 Central Kupreanof Is/Road System | Existing Condition | 0 | 8 | 0 | 0 | 8 |
| | Proposed Action and Alternative 2 | 353 | 2,293 | 529 | 353 | 3,528 |
| 10 Southwest Kupreanof Island | Existing Condition | 17 | 365 | 2 | 0 | 384 |
| | Proposed Action and Alternative 2 | 147 | 955 | 220 | 147 | 1,469 |
| 11 Rowan Bay/Bay of Pillars | Existing Condition | 26 | 89 | 16 | 1 | 132 |
| | Proposed Action and Alternative 2 | 96 | 627 | 145 | 96 | 964 |

2 Alternatives

| Study Area | Comparison | Recreation Visitor Days | | | | |
|---|--------------------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|
| | | Spring (April 1 – May 31) | Summer (June 1 – Aug 30) | Fall (Sept 1 – Oct 31) | Winter (Nov 1 – Mar 31) | Total Annual ¹ |
| 12A Saginaw/Security/ Washington Bays | Existing Condition | 90 | 308 | 94 | 2 | 494 |
| | Proposed Action | 129 | 839 | 194 | 129 | 1,291 |
| | Alternative 2 | 90 | 942 | 129 | 129 | 1,291 |
| 12B Kuiu Island Road System | Existing Condition | 23 | 66 | 72 | 1 | 162 |
| | Proposed Action and Alternative 2 | 213 | 1,381 | 319 | 213 | 2,125 |
| 13 Tebenkof Bay/Kuiu Wilderness | Existing Condition | 54 | 363 | 7 | 2 | 426 |
| | Proposed Action and Alternative 2 | 289 | 1,880 | 434 | 289 | 2,893 |
| 14 Keku Strait/Port Camden | Existing Condition | 45 | 283 | 40 | 3 | 371 |
| | Proposed Action | 156 | 1,015 | 234 | 156 | 1,562 |
| | Alternative 2 | 109 | 1,140 | 156 | 156 | 1,562 |
| 15 South Kuiu Island | Existing Condition | 7 | 264 | 0 | 1 | 272 |
| | Proposed Action and Alternative 2 | 126 | 816 | 188 | 126 | 1,255 |
| 16 Reid/No Name Bays | Existing Condition | 6 | 136 | 1 | 0 | 143 |
| | Proposed Action and Alternative 2 | 112 | 728 | 168 | 112 | 1,120 |

| Study Area | Comparison | Recreation Visitor Days | | | | |
|---------------------------------|-----------------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|
| | | Spring (April 1 – May 31) | Summer (June 1 – Aug 30) | Fall (Sept 1 – Oct 31) | Winter (Nov 1 – Mar 31) | Total Annual ¹ |
| 21 Muddy River Area | Existing Condition | 0 | 134 | 47 | 31 | 212 |
| | Proposed Action and Alternative 2 | 129 | 841 | 194 | 129 | 1,294 |
| 22 Thomas Bay/Point Vandeput | Existing Condition | 13 | 239 | 13 | 17 | 282 |
| | Proposed Action and Alternative 2 | 126 | 820 | 189 | 126 | 1,261 |
| 23 Farragut Bay/Cape Fanshaw | Existing Condition | 1 | 30 | 1 | 0 | 32 |
| | Proposed Action and Alternative 2 | 120 | 780 | 180 | 120 | 1,200 |
| 24 Baird/Patterson Glaciers | Existing Condition | 1 | 8 | 6 | 0 | 15 |
| | Proposed Action and Alternative 2 | 41 | 265 | 61 | 41 | 407 |

¹Totals may vary due to rounding.

² This number is higher than proposed allocation; however, 90 percent of the use is from one outfitter and guide in one recreation place. The recreation place is a camp located on a hardened site and it does not experience many impacts. There is some bear hunting and other use in this study area, but conflict between users has not been reported.

2 Alternatives

Table 2.4. This table briefly outlines the existing condition and each of the alternatives and shows the differences through a comparison of issues and effects.

| Issue | | Existing Condition (Actual Use) | Proposed Action | Alternative 2 |
|---|--------|------------------------------------|-----------------|---------------|
| Issue 1. Does the alternative provide stable business opportunities? | | | | |
| <i>Measurements</i> | | | | |
| Guided user RVDs within the project area (percentage of total RVDs) | | 1.2% | 11% | 11% |
| Guided user RVDs by season | Spring | 361 | 3,960 | 3,874 |
| | Summer | 3,450 | 25,741 | 25,969 |
| | Fall | 380 | 5,939 | 5,796 |
| | Winter | 66 | 3,960 | 3,960 |
| Issue 2. Does the alternative address conflicts within the commercial outfitter and guide industry? | | | | |
| <i>Measurements</i> | | | | |
| Allocates use by season to limit outfitter and guide use in the spring and fall to provide for more opportunities for solitude? | | Not applicable | Yes | Yes |
| Addresses conflict between users in Study Areas 12A and 14 by further limiting commercial use in the spring and fall? | | Not applicable | No | Yes |

Alternative Considered but Eliminated from Further Study

A wilderness alternative was considered during the planning process that would have reduced the allocation of outfitter and guide use within study areas that include the Petersburg Creek-Duncan Salt Chuck, Tebenkof Bay, and Kuiu Wilderness areas. However, it was decided that, at this time, there is no need to further reduce or restrict use by commercial outfitters in wilderness on PRD. Also, restricting commercial use in wilderness would contradict the Commercial Services Needs Assessments completed for the three wildernesses on the district. The Needs Assessments support the use of commercial guides to help the public access wilderness for some activities (see Appendix C).



West Point Forest Service Cabin, Petersburg Ranger District. Photograph by Marina Whitacre.

2 Alternatives



Sea lions at Horn Cliffs, east of Petersburg. Photograph by Chuck Ressler.